

**Minutes of the 5th Seminar on Environmental Auditing and
the 4th Working Meeting of ASOSAI WGEA**

15- 17 April 2014, Hanoi, Vietnam

The 5th Seminar on Environmental Auditing and 4th Meeting of ASOSAI Working Group on Environment Audit (WGEA) was held in Hanoi, Vietnam from 15th to 17th April, 2014 with participation of 60 delegates coming from 22 Supreme Audit Institutions and international organizations.

1. Welcome speech by Auditor General of SAI Vietnam

H.E. Dr. Nguyen Huu Van, Auditor General of Vietnam welcomed Dr. Dong Dasheng, Deputy Auditor General of National Audit Office of China, the Chair of ASOSAI Working group on Environmental Auditing, and all other delegates to Vietnam. He feels grateful to be given the honor to host the seminar and meeting in Hanoi. He states that recognizing the importance of environmental protection to the national development, SAV has incorporated environmental auditing in annual audit plans as a crucial audit topic and has recently carried out many environmental audits. Audit findings of those audits form a solid base for important audit conclusions and audit recommendations to address problems associated with environmental protection. He also states that with 03 themes of discussion namely (1) Audit on Solid waste, (2) Audit on Atmospheric environment, and (3) Audit on Sustainable energy, the 5th ASOSAI seminar on “Environmental Auditing” would be a forum for all member SAIs of ASOSAI to share knowledge and experiences in the field of environmental auditing and other related problems, share common concern and enhance the cooperation in performing transnational audits to constantly affirm values and benefits of SAIs to the development of our own countries. He also affirms that SAI Vietnam has been actively involved in environmental auditing activities to ensure the effective management, exploitation and use of natural resources. In concluding his speech, Dr. Nguyen Huu Van wishes that the meeting will be success with fruitful results.

2. INTOSAI WGEA's Remarks

H.E Mr. Sapto Amal Damandari – Board member of SAI Indonesia – in representing the Chair of INTOSAI WGEA conveys the warmest greeting and wishes the best of luck for the meeting from the Chairman of INTOSAI WGEA. He continues by stating WGEA membership, functioning and its working plan for 2014 – 2016, which includes 9 topics, subject to be hosted in different SAIs.

3. Opening Remarks by the representative of Chair of ASOSAI WGEA

Dr. Dong Dasheng, Deputy Auditor General of China on behalf of Mr. Liu Jiayi – Auditor General of SAI China, Chairman of ASOSAI WGEA, and Auditor General of China conveys warm welcome and cordial greetings to all participants and observers and thanks to Dr. Nguyen Huu Van, Auditor General of SAI Vietnam, and his staffs for the excellent preparation and organization job they have done for this meeting. He said that the seminar on environmental auditing of ASOSAI WGEA would be an important forum for member of ASOSAI to share information and exchange experiences in the field of environmental auditing. He shared with all participants information about environmental protection and environmental audit in China, including Chinese Government's efforts in and attention to environmental protection, Action Plan issued by the State Council of China in September 2013, positive actions taken by Chinese central and local governments and relevant departments, Chinese Government's efforts in and concrete measures taken for energy conservation and emission reduction, environmental audits carried out by The National Audit Office of China in recent years. He also states that as a professional committee and a regional coordinator of INTOSAI, the ASOSAI WGEA will actively respond and act on the call by The Beijing Declaration, and play a better role in promoting development of environmental protection in Asia. He expresses the hope that ASOSAI's SAI members would make the best use of our professional advantages in the field of environmental protection, and enhance cooperation with each other. Finally, he wishes the great success for the meeting.

4. ASOSAI WGEA's Report

The work report of ASOSAI is presented by Dr. Dong Dasheng from SAI China. He begins his presentation by mentioning the ASOSAI WGEA's Work plan for 2014 - 2016. He states that environmental audits have been conducted by most SAIs. Dr. Dong then talks about carrying out two surveys on environmental auditing. He also highlights the cooperative environmental audit on Mekong River Basin was successfully completed.

Dr. Dong also talks about main activities of the ASOSAI WGEA Secretariat in the recent years: CNAO attended the 15th INTOSAI WGEA Meeting held in Estonia; Two representatives participated in the 13th Meeting of the Steering Committee in Indonesia; and the communication of Secretariat with other WGEAs.

Dr. Dong concludes his presentation by calling upon all SAls to strengthen the communication and cooperation with INTOSAI WGEA and regional working group.

5. INTOSAI WGEA's report

The report of INTOSAI was presented by H.E Sapto Amal Damandari, the representative of Chair of INTOSAI WGEA. He begins his presentation by mentioning 2014-2016 WP project plans. After that, he mentioned activities of WGEA Secretariat, notably: Tendering of WGEA Website; the first international training course on Environmental auditing in INTOSAI WGEA Global Training Facility (GTF) held in iCED di Jaipur, India during 8 – 13 December 2013; etc.

He also talks about WGEA Secretariat's activities which will be carried out soon: The annual audit collection on May 2014 will be submitted by September 2014; The 8th environmental audit survey will be submitted by April 2015; Greenlines will be published by June 2014; The 2nd program of the GTF on "Introduction to Environment Audit" India is expected to be held during 14 – 27 November 2014 in Jaipur, India; Dissemination of Training Module in Forestry Auditing is expected to be held during 7th – 13th September 2014 in Indonesia; the Assembly Meeting is expected to be held on 29th September to 3rd October 2014 in Philippines.

6. AFROSAI WGEA's report

The report of AFROSAI WGEA was presented by Mr. Ndioro Emmanuel from AI Cameroon. Firstly, he introduces the structure of AFROSAI which includes 18 members, divided into 3 Language Subgroup. He goes on by sharing some achievements of AFROSAI such as the development of new tools, the improvement of existing audit tools, the increase number of environmental audits conducted individually and cooperatively. The result is said to draw some practices that can be share and inspire others:

- The need of cooperative audits because the environmental issue affects more than one single country and involves the use of several countries of a unique natural resource.

- The emphasis on the exchange of experiences through mentoring, given that SAI has different environment audit experiences.

He concludes his remarks by stating the prospects of Africa's environmental audit are contained in the AFROSAI WGEA's Work Plan 2014 – 2016 on three main axes:

- Training and continuous sensitization of SAIs in environmental auditing
- Execution of project studies and cooperative audits
- Dynamic communication

7. Presentation – Environmental audit on the Mekong river basin management

Ms. Anchaleekorn Pravarana - Representative from SAI Thailand gives an overview on the joint cooperative environmental audit activity between SAI Cambodia, Lao PDR, Myanmar, Thailand and Vietnam which focuses on Mekong River Basin. She talks about the audit design matrix, structure of the audit report; she also highlights the audit constraints including communication (language barrier), limited human resources, funding, limited experiences and tools, limited of time and different mandate. Those areas are needed to be improved in order to have a more efficient joint audit. She concludes her presentation by presenting benefits of the audit and pointing out supports needed such as expert (SME), parallel audit, E.A guideline, training (international and on-the-job training)/workshop/seminar, and funding.

8. Presentation – Increase the impact of environmental performance audits

Mr. Edward Simanjuntak, fellowship of CCAF-FCVI presents on how to increase the impact of environmental performance audit. Firstly, the importance and possible impacts that can be resulted from environmental audit is stated. Then, he mentions on the foundations of a successful audit which includes a solid methodology, qualified people and a sound knowledge of the subject matter. Each phase of an audit and criteria to ensure its quality are also brought out. He concludes his speech by mentioning that the impact of environmental performance audit can be enhanced through better and more effectively managed program. The motto is "We don't inherit the Earth from our parents, we borrow it from our children".

9. Presentation by Vietnam Environment administration

Dr. Duong Thanh An – Director of Policy and Legal affairs Department presents an overview of environmental management in Vietnam. Firstly, he states environmental

challenges in Vietnam which lie in 4 areas: Increasing environmental pollution, Biodiversity degradation, Environmental security threatened and Role of the community in environmental management need to strengthen. To tackle the problems, several policies and legal systems on environmental protection are formed including 2 important law approved by the National Assembly and environmental protection fees and environmental tax are applied. Other than that, the state budget for environmental protection is increased; more attention in investigation and monitoring of waste and international cooperation is also enhanced.

10. Session I: Presentation on Audit on Solid waste (Moderator: Ms. Fadzilah Binti Mohammad, SAI Malaysia)

There are eleven country paper presentations on the topic “Audit on Solid Waste” from SAIs of Vietnam, China, India, Indonesia, Iraq, Jordan, Kuwait, Malaysia Philippines, Russian Federation and Turkey (in timely order). The main ideas are summarized as follows:

- **Significant impact of the solid waste:** *It is realized that solid waste is a common concern in all parts of the world. The solid waste amount is continuously rising every year in the world due to rapid increase in population, accelerated urbanization and industrialization process. Solid waste has caused adverse impacts on water, land, air environment and public health. The alarming amount of solid waste has put pressure on governments and local authorities to continually seek new management strategies to deal with these wastes issues.*
- **SAIs efforts to tackle the issue and audit methodology:** *Solid waste audits have been carried out by SAIs with the aim of examining the economy, efficiency, and effectiveness of solid waste management. The audit methodology contains a variety of range, included the consultation with internal related organizations (many SAIs), applying Guidelines of INTOSAI (SAI India and Jordan), referring to World Health Organization’s related documents (SAI Iraq), citizen survey on sampling design and data processing/analysis (SAI Philippines).*
- **Audit findings:** *Findings of solid waste audits give focus on the lack of community awareness about solid waste management issues, unclear and*

incomprehensive regulations on solid waste management, weakness of law enforcement for solid waste, the lack of specific national strategic plans on waste management, weakness of management and limited capacity of municipalities, limitation of monitoring and control activities by functional authorities and insufficient capacity for treatment, improper management of solid waste.

- **Recommendations:** *SAIs raise recommendations to improve the solid waste management as follows: the awareness of communities about solid waste management issues should be enhanced; there should be comprehensive regulations on solid waste management; it is required to give more focus on developing effective means of waste minimization and sustainable development strategies; more standard waste sorting and recycling plants should be established; it is required to create a media awareness plan that will encourage people to use recycling facilities that are available to them; Cooperation with other SAIs to carry out cooperative audits for learning and sharing mutual experience.*

11. Session II: Presentation on Research and Audit on Atmospheric Environment (Moderator: Ms. Penelope R. Quesada, SAI Philippines)

There are four country paper presentations on Solid Waste Audit from SAIs of Bangladesh, China, Iran and Thailand with the following topics. The following contents were mentioned in most papers:

- **The importance of atmospheric protection:** *Air pollution is one of the most severe environmental problems in the world. Air pollution is increased due to the further advance of industrialization and urbanization as well as the energy resource consumption. Air pollution causes direct environmental impacts and serious effects on public health. Air pollution has required authorities to seek measures for air quality control.*
- **Air pollution audits:** *have been carried out by SAIs with the aim of examining whether controlling and monitoring activities achieve the goals or not and promoting prevention and control of air pollution. It is realized that air pollution is mainly caused by vehicles on roads and construction activities. Findings of air pollution audits give focus on the lack of proper air quality control system,*

inadequate supervision of functional authorities, and contractor's failure in implementing contract terms.

- **The following recommendations were mentioned:** Governments, local authorities and residents should be involved in air pollution preventing and mitigating activities; Road and site cleaning standards should be set; Contractors should prepare a space for cleaning up the construction vehicles, cover dust items or keep them in the closed areas and sprinkling water on top to prevent the dust; It is required to put a large investment amount into air quality control.
- **Question and Answer:** SAI Malaysia raised questions to SAI Iran on the mechanism to reduce air pollution which is generated from vehicles/ traffic means and which agencies involved in air environment protection. SAI Iran answers that there are many programs and projects on air pollution reduction. Police, government at municipal level and other related agencies will be involved in air environment protection activities. Unfortunately, the governmental departments have not really been unified, nor cooperate with each other effectively. The recommendation is government agencies should coordinate with each other more closely and effectively on issues air pollution prevention and mitigation.

12. Session III: Presentation on Audit on Sustainable Energy

There are three country paper presentations on Sustainable energy from SAIs of Australia, China and Korea. The following contents were mentioned in most papers:

- **Government's initiatives to reduce energy waste:** Energy waste has been highlighted by respective government. Each government has launched variety of program to tackle the problem: Smart City Program in Australia, the implementation of industrial structure adjustment and optimization policies, key energy conservation projects and the progress of new energy and renewable energy projects by China; and different methods to manage waste energy (landfill, incineration, recycle or ocean dump) by Korea

- **Audit findings:** SAI within respective countries have conducted audit in order to access the effectiveness and efficiency or the above-mentioning programs. The findings in general are optimistic but vary to a different country's perspective. The audit findings also points out scope for improvement in several areas including

aspects of the grant assessment and selection process, including probity arrangements and the measurement and reporting of program performance; the role of local government should be enhanced; the supported projects' construction should be speed up based on the economic feasibility and technological stability; and improper execution on the procurement, construction and supervision must be rectified.

The 4th ASOSAI WGEA's Working Meeting

13. Presentation by ASOSAI WGEA Secretariat on the adoption of the 2014 – 2016 Work plan of ASOSAI WGEA

The Secretariat of ASOSAI WGEA gives a briefing on the progress of 2014-2016 Work Plan of ASOSAI WGEA. He highlights that 7 SAIs (Azerbaijan, Bangladesh, Cyprus, Japan, Korea, Malaysia, Thailand) gave comments and feedbacks on the draft of 2014-2016 Work Plan. He also conveyed sincere gratitude and thanks to all members SAIs of ASOSAI for your active participation in and strong support to the work of the WGEA and its Secretariat.

14. Discussion on Venue for the 6th Seminar and 5th Meeting of WGEA

SAI India makes an official announcement to agree to host the 6th Seminar and 5th Meeting of WGEA in 2016. The venue and the date for the meeting will be decided later. The Chair thanks to SAI India, on behalf of all members for their gracious offer.

15. Other item for discussion

There was no other issue for discussion at the meeting

16. Closing remarks and Summing up

In wrapping up the event, on behalf of Mr. Liu Jiayi, Chairman of the ASOSAI WGEA and Auditor General of SAI China, Dr. Dong Dasheng congratulated all the participants on the complete success of the meeting. He highly appreciates all SAIs for excellent presentations which enhance the sharing knowledge and experience in the field of environmental auditing. He also expresses the sincere thank to Dr. Nguyen Huu Van, Auditor General of SAI Vietnam and his officers for organizing and hosting this meeting, and expresses his gratitude to all members of the Working Group for their active participation and support. Dr. Dong Dasheng then declares this meeting closed.

Annexure

No.	SAI/ Country	Name	Position
A. DELEGATES			
1.	Australia	Mr. Mark Thomas Simpson	Executive Director
2.	Bangladesh	Mr. Masud Ahmed	Comptroller & Auditor General
3.		Mr. Delwar Husain	Deputy Comptroller & Auditor General (Senior)
4.		Dr. Dong Dasheng	Deputy Auditor General
5.	China	Mrs. Wang Dannong	Director General
6.		Mr. Jiang Haiying	Deputy Director General
7.		Mrs. Chen Jixiang	Director
8.		Mr. Xing Jiangfeng	Director
9.		Mr. Zhai Chuanqiang	Principal staff
10.		Mr. LIU GANG	Principal staff
11.	AFROSAI WGEA Cameroon	Mr. Ndioro Emmanuel Jean Paul	Auditor
12.		Mr. Bekemen Moukoko Francois	Assistant Auditor
13.	Cambodia	Mrs. Sochen DA Keo	Deputy Director
14.		Mrs. Mao Norlak	Deputy Chief of Division
15.	Iran	Ms. Narges Rezapour	Auditor
16.		Mr. Seyed Abbas Mirnajafi	Principal Auditor
17.	Iraq	Mr. Rafil Yassein Al-Assady	Director General
18.		Ms. Saosan Salman Ahmad	Chief of audit team
19.		Mr. Ammer A. Anteki)	Chief of Agriculture Engineers
20.		Ms. Rana Ali Manea	Translator
21.	India	Ms. Nameeta Prasad	Director
22.	Indonesia	Mr. Sapto Amal Damandrari	Board member of Audit Board
23.		Mrs. Sri Hartati Candra Dewi	
24.		Mrs. Ami Rahmawati	Officer
25.	Jordan	Mrs. Sahar I. R. Arabeyat	Director
26.	Korea	Mr. Youngseok Kim	Director/ Division 2
27.		Mr. Burmshik Kim	Assistant Director
28.	Kuwait	Mrs. Husah H Alrashed	Auditor
29.		Mr. Fahad A Alfahad	
30.		Noura H.A.A. Altarkait	First Auditor

		<i>Mrs. Noura Hamad Alterkait</i>	
31.		<i>Mr. Nawaf A.S.Y. Buhaimad</i>	
32.	<i>Lao PDR</i>	<i>Mr. Padapphet Sayakhot</i>	Vice-President
33.		<i>Mr. Nalongsak Sattaroun</i>	<i>Head of Regional Office</i>
34.		<i>Mr. Oley Sayyavong</i>	<i>Technical Staff</i>
35.		<i>Mr. Alounyadeth Sthanovong</i>	<i>Technical Staff</i>
36.		<i>Mr. Phoneviseth Chalennphon</i>	<i>Technical staff</i>
37.	<i>Malaysia</i>	<i>Mrs. Fadzilah Binti Mohammad</i>	<i>Deputy Audit Director</i>
38.		<i>Mrs. Mariaty Binti Mohd</i>	<i>State Deputy Audit Director</i>
39.	<i>Oman</i>	<i>Mr. Badar Rashid Saif Al Dhahli</i>	<i>Director</i>
40.	<i>Russian Federation</i>	<i>Mr. Denis Sidorenko</i>	<i>Chief Inspector</i>
41.		<i>Mr. Sergey Neroev</i>	<i>Director</i>
42.	<i>Turkey</i>	<i>Mr. Rafet Dogan</i>	<i>Member of TCA</i>
43.		<i>Mr. Hacı Omer Kose</i>	<i>Principal Auditor</i>
44.		<i>Mrs. Berna Erkan</i>	<i>Auditor</i>
45.	<i>Thailand</i>	<i>Ms. Anchaleekorn Pravarana</i>	<i>Auditor, Professional Level</i>
46.		<i>Ms. Yupaporn Kaibuddee</i>	<i>Auditor, Professional Level</i>
47.	<i>Philippines</i>	<i>Ms. Penelope Resngit Quesada</i>	<i>Supervising Research Specialist</i>
48.		<i>Mrs. Gloria De Guzman Silverio</i>	<i>State Auditor</i>
49.		<i>Mrs. Rosa Agrave Dela Cruz</i>	<i>State Auditor</i>
50.		<i>Mr. Danilo Mangahas Dela Cruz</i>	
51.	<i>Vietnam</i>	<i>Mr. Nguyen Anh Phuong</i>	<i>Titular head of division</i>
52.		<i>Mr. Nguyen Tuan Trung</i>	<i>Deputy head of division</i>
53.		<i>Ms. Vu Thi Thanh Hai</i>	<i>Deputy head of division</i>
54.		<i>Ms. Nguyen T. Nguyet Anh</i>	<i>Official</i>
55.		<i>Mr. Le Hoai Chau</i>	<i>Assistant auditor</i>
B. OBSERVERS			
56.	<i>CCAF-FCVI Canada</i>	<i>Ms. Caroline Jorgensen</i>	<i>Director, International Programs</i>
57.	<i>CCAF-FCVI Indonesia</i>	<i>Mr. Edward Gandahasi Hasiholan Simanjuntak</i>	<i>Secretariat of INTOSAI WGEA</i>
58.	<i>GIZ Cambodia</i>	<i>Mr. Denis Roy</i>	<i>Advisor</i>